



“ENHANCING LABOR LAW COMPLIANCE IN THE AMERICAS”

DECEMBER 5-6, 2023

WASHINGTON D.C. AND ON-LINE

@RIAL_OAS | rialnet.org



OUTCOMES AND RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE HEMISPHERIC WORKSHOP

“Enhancing labor law compliance in the Americas”

CONTENT

- Introduction 2**
- Main ideas and general considerations..... 3**
 - 1.1. General considerations.....3
 - 1.2. Main ideas around the implementation of innovative technologies in labor inspection4
 - 1.3. Main ideas around a preventive approach in labor inspection5
 - 1.4. Challenges6
- Recommendations..... 7**
 - 2.1. Recommendations on the incorporation of innovative technologies in labor inspection.....8
 - 2.2. Recommendations on the need to implement a preventive approach to labor law compliance9
- Evaluation of the Workshop10**
- Annexes12**
 - Workshop’s Agenda 12
 - List of participants 15

INTRODUCTION

The Hemispheric Workshop “**Enhancing labor law compliance in the Americas**” took place on December 5-6, 2023, in a hybrid format, in Washington D.C., United States. It involved the participation of 29 countries from the region, represented by delegations from Ministries of Labor, workers’ representatives (CEATAL) and employers’ representatives (COSATE), Spain's representation as an observer country of the OAS, and representatives from the International Labour Organization (ILO). The Workshop was an activity of the Inter-American Network for Labor Administration (RIAL) of the OAS, and it was sponsored by the United States Department of Labor (USDOL).

The Workshop, which is part of the 2022-2024 Work Plan of the Inter-American Conference of Ministers of Labor (IACML) of the OAS, responded to mandates set forth by the Ministers of Labor of the region in the Declaration and Plan of Action of Buenos Aires, adopted at the XXI IACML in 2021. In line with said mandates, the **general objective** of the Hemispheric Workshop was to strengthen the capacities and increase knowledge of Ministries of Labor to improve compliance with labor laws by enhancing innovative labor inspection practices and a preventive approach to law enforcement. The **specific objectives** were the following:

- Identify, exchange, and analyze innovative labor inspection strategies, particularly those incorporating the use of new technologies in the planning, programming, and deployment of inspections.
- Exchange information regarding the types of new technologies utilized by Ministries of Labor to enhance labor inspection.
- Identify, exchange, and analyze strategies from Ministries of Labor to prevent non-compliance with labor laws, including awareness-raising, communication, and education strategies for workers and employers.
- Prepare recommendations to strengthen labor inspection and develop a preventive approach to law enforcement to support Ministries of Labor in enhancing compliance with labor laws.

To meet the stated objectives, the Workshop had two thematic sessions: the first one on “Innovative technologies in labor inspection”, and the second on “Complementing labor inspection: a preventive approach to law enforcement”; both had guiding questions to frame the discussion. Within the sessions there were presentations of demonstrative experiences from Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Guyana, Jamaica, and United States; as well as presentations from ILO, and from COSATE and CEATAL. There were also ample spaces for dialogue where Ministries and representatives of workers and employers were able to share their experiences and perspectives.

On the second day of the event, a sub-groups exercise was carried out so that the participants could discuss in greater depth and collectively respond to the question: what key lessons learned, and policy recommendations can be identified, based on the discussions during the Workshop, to strengthen labor inspection, particularly with the use of new technologies, and develop a preventive approach to law enforcement?

Three (3) sub-groups were formed (2 virtual and 1 in person), with government delegates from Argentina, Canada and Costa Rica as moderators and rapporteurs. The delegations of the participating Ministries, ILO, as well as representatives of workers and employers, actively participated in the sub-groups.

This document gathers the main ideas and recommendations that emerged from the Hemispheric Workshop, both from its thematic sessions and from the sub-groups exercise, to strengthen the strategies and policies related to labor law compliance through mechanisms based on the use of technology and a preventive approach.

MAIN IDEAS AND GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS

The Workshop had two thematic sessions: the first one on “Innovative technologies in labor inspection” and the second on “Complementing labor inspection: a preventive approach to law enforcement”. Both sessions included guiding questions to frame the discussion and facilitate the identification of lessons learned and recommendations.

Below is a summary of the main ideas that emerged from the presentations of the speakers of each session, the interventions during the dialogue spaces where the Ministries and social actors shared their national experiences, and the sub-groups exercise. A later section of the Report consolidates the policy recommendations identified.

1.1. General considerations

- Labor law compliance, including the strengthening of labor inspection systems and the promotion of a preventive approach, is a priority for the region. There is a broad consensus that **tripartite dialogue** and **collaboration among authorities, employers, and workers** are essential to achieve both objectives.
- Participants noted that a clear commitment from governments to **prioritize labor administration and strengthen State capacities for joint planning and concerted action to conduct inspections is essential to ensure enforcement**. This entails a commitment to convene representative actors from the world of work around institutionalized social dialogue.
- The importance of **ensuring decent and dignified working conditions for the inspection workers themselves** -protecting their safety in inspection processes and respecting their right to freedom of association and collective bargaining- was highlighted. This was particularly pointed out by workers’ representatives, grouped under COSATE.
- An important step forward is the **creation of specialized inspection teams**. By receiving on-going training and specializing in a particular area, inspectors are better prepared to address different areas such as occupational safety and health, gender, migration, among others.
- Participants highlighted the need to **promote greater inter-institutional collaboration, particularly between Ministries of Labor and other government entities such as the Public Prosecutor's Office**, to improve implementation of new inspection technologies and strengthen a preventive approach to labor law compliance.

1.2. Main ideas around the implementation of innovative technologies in labor inspection

- Delegations highlighted the importance of **technology as a valuable tool for deploying labor law compliance actions**. In the experiences presented during the workshop, the use of technological tools led to improvements in various aspects of labor inspection, such as the **reduction of processing times**.
- Delegations also acknowledged that **technology is a tool to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of labor administration and, particularly, labor inspection**. Therefore, it has a direct impact on the protection of workers' rights, which includes fundamental principles and rights at work, as well as better outcomes for employers.
- **Technology represents an opportunity to explore new approaches to inspection in challenging environments, such as the rural sector or the Amazon region**. Participants highlighted the use of **drones** for inspections and the **transmission of coordinates, images, and videos in real time**. This enables inspectors to reach locations they had previously not been able to access. Some examples mentioned at the workshop include:
 - Argentina highlighted the use of drones. In 2022, the Inspection Secretariat, with the support of the ILO, proposed the design and implementation of an inspection training and management project, which includes the handling of unmanned aerial vehicles by inspectors.
 - The United States pointed out the use of drones has had a positive impact on the safety and health of inspectors. Thanks to this technology, inspections can be carried out in areas where inspectors could not enter given their unsafe conditions, such as landslides or collapsed structures.
 - Peru highlighted the use of drones in rural or hard-to-reach urban areas, pointing out that almost 800 drone inspections were carried out in 2023 through the Sub-Directorate of Special Interventions of the National Superintendence of Labor Inspection (SUNAFIL).
- Several delegations indicated that technology allows them to have an **orderly and systematized record of inspections**. Such systematization is of essence for the execution of on-site visits, as it helps inspectors identify the typology and guide the inspection in a more specialized manner. Moreover, delegations also drew attention to the value of **digitizing files and all administrative procedures** to improve inspection records.
- Systematization also facilitates the **evaluation of inspection outcomes and of the variables involved through a quantitative approach**. Having specific data on the number of workers, subject matter inspected, compliance rate, among others, allows the labor administration to evaluate its results and develop improvements based on evidence.
- Additionally, a **computerized system** allows inspectors to develop an internal case flowchart and access **background information** of the same or similar cases; have greater knowledge about a specific problem; and identify if there is a recurrence of non-compliance, among other benefits.

This not only improves the **approach to a particular case**, but also allows **the inspection to identify recurring issues and generate policies to address them**.

- The systematization of information also allows for **better measuring the inspectors' personal and professional development**, aiming to achieve better performance evaluations and establish incentives, rewards, and training needs, among others.
- Delegations emphasized the importance of **continuous awareness-raising and training efforts for inspectors regarding technological tools**. Specifically, they mentioned the creation of training schools that involve learning exchanges with delegations of inspectors from other countries. **Technology applications must be easy to use, and inspection officers should receive training to benefit from them**.
- It should be considered that, beyond pilot experiences, **labor inspection conditions** -in terms of equipment and other technological tools-, **must be conducive to implementing policies that involve technology and are sustainable over time**.
- Participants noted the need to establish a **national digital transformation agenda** involving all government entities to guide policies implemented by labor inspectorates. This agenda ensures labor inspection policies are anchored in **clear regulatory frameworks and promotes congruence with other policies implemented by different ministries**. Furthermore, participants agreed on the importance of developing joint action plans including the participation of ministries and entities engaged in labor inspection and labor law compliance.
- **The security, privacy and confidentiality of inspection data**, from both audited workers and companies, **must be guaranteed at all times. National privacy and information protection policies and laws must be respected** throughout the process of data comparison and information sharing. It is also crucial to ensure that data analysis does not infringe on the fundamental rights of any individual.
- Participants noted the importance of socializing the use of new technologies in labor inspection with social actors to **gather experiences on their usage, identify challenges, and receive recommendations for their effective implementation**. The employers' representatives, grouped in CEATAL, highlighted that enterprises have varied experience in applying technology for risk self-assessment and monitoring compliance indicators, as well as tools that can be shared with the State under public-private cooperation.

1.3. Main ideas around a preventive approach in labor inspection

- There was broad consensus that **sanctions should not be the main purpose of labor inspection, but rather a deterrence tool to be complemented with a preventive approach in labor law compliance**. The institutional framework of this preventive approach is key to consolidating multisectoral dialogue and, thus, strengthening compliance with all labor standards.
- The previous point is reinforced by the erroneous idea of the role of labor inspection as a system for imposing sanctions, forgetting that it is an **institution to monitor the rightful application of labor standards and that said application is for both employers and workers, and for both formal and informal enterprises**.

- In the discussion, the exchange of ideas on **finances for non-compliance** stood out, and participants mentioned **strategies to eliminate the reactive approach of the inspection sanction**. For example, the Chilean delegation shared a practice focused on SMEs, which seeks to replace the pecuniary fine with a training program on labor matters, granted as long as the non-compliance does not risk the worker's life.
- Notwithstanding, participants agreed that the **deterrent effect of administrative and financial sanctions remains relevant to achieve a culture of compliance**, especially in a continent with limited resources for effective labor inspection.
- Delegations also highlighted that **accessible communication** has strengthened preventive approaches to labor law compliance by allowing for wider dissemination of the benefits of voluntary compliance and greater awareness among the actors involved.
- Participants noted the importance of having **Ministries of Labor in the media for at least two reasons**: it shows the labor administration is accessible and open to dialogue and allows information to be disseminated much more widely, reaching a greater number of people.
- Participants shared **innovative communication strategies**, such as the one developed by Peru's SUNAFIL, which has an alliance with movie theaters to project advertising on labor rights prior to the start of films.
- The delegations stressed the importance of the **role of social actors in labor law compliance**; as well as the importance of **strong and institutionalized social dialogue** as a tool to promote democracy in industrial relations and the workplace.
- The employers' sector, represented by CEATAL, highlighted their **commitment to raising awareness and increasing knowledge of labor laws by employers, both formal and informal**. The delegate pointed out this allows for better compliance with labor law and the development of better conditions for workers in both the informal and formal sectors.
- The workers' representatives, grouped in COSATE, called for a comprehensive vision in building a **culture of prevention based on institutionalized tripartite social dialogue** with the effective participation of trade unions and full respect for freedom of association and collective bargaining. Such construction of a culture of prevention also requires the strengthening of the State, the strengthening of labor inspection, and the protection of all workers. They also highlighted the importance of protecting union presence in the workplace to promote compliance with labor laws.
- Delegations highlighted that **the credibility of labor inspection is a key element to encourage labor law compliance** and that communication strategies can play an important role in increasing such credibility.

1.4. Challenges

Throughout the Workshop, both in plenary sessions as well as in the sub-groups exercise, the delegations identified some common challenges:

- In various instances, delegations pointed out the **geographical characteristics** of the region lead to an accessibility challenge for the inspection authorities. Participants noted the lack of logistics and tools that allow for effective inspections in rural, mining, and other hard-to-reach sectors is an unresolved challenge.
- **New forms of employment**, such as work on digital platforms and telework, as well as the shift in production patterns structured in global production chains, work in free-trade and rural zones, and informality, were also recognized as challenges for labor inspection, as in many instances (such as in the platform economy) they blur the traditional/conventional categories of work on which the inspection operates.
- The representatives of COSATE affirmed the importance of paying attention to the situation of vulnerable groups in the context of multiple crises, considering they are predominantly employed in informal and precarious jobs, and face obstacles to access complaint mechanisms. Therefore, inspection systems need to take proactive actions to reach these groups.
- A recurring theme emphasized throughout the dialogue was the **budgetary constraints**, which represent a major obstacle to incorporating or, in some cases, even maintaining programs that involve the use of new technologies. The lack of funds is also a challenge for **labor inspector training**, which should be constant and comprehensive.
- Regarding the previous point, participants noted that not all countries are able to carry out continuous processes of technology incorporation. Despite efforts made, there is still an insufficient number of inspectors in the region, and scarce material and financial resources. **Budgetary constraints and/or lack of political will make it difficult to provide human resources and adequate means to the inspection systems.**
- The need to **build incentives and strengthen training of inspectors to promote the use of technological tools** in labor inspection was recognized, acknowledging there is still some resistance to these changes.
- One of the most significant challenges is the **lack of parallelism between technological advancements and legal advancements**. Throughout the dialogue, participants highlighted that legal norms do not advance as fast as technological change.

RECOMMENDATIONS

During the Workshop, three discussion sub-groups were formed so delegates could discuss in greater depth and collectively respond to the question: “what key lessons learned, and policy recommendations can be identified, based on the discussions during the Workshop, to strengthen labor inspection and develop a preventive approach to law enforcement?” These sub-groups were moderated by government delegates from Argentina, Canada, and Costa Rica.

Hereinafter, the recommendations that emerged from both the exercise in sub-groups and in the plenary sessions of the Workshop are consolidated under each of the proposed themes:

2.1. Recommendations on the incorporation of innovative technologies in labor inspection

- Delegations stressed the importance of **incorporating IT tools into their inspection systems and, where they already exist, maintaining them over time and integrating them into a single system.** In this regard, the following specific recommendations were mentioned:
 - **Provide Ministries of Labor with sufficient resources**, both budgetary and training resources, to efficiently and effectively incorporate new technologies in their operations.
 - **Support the incorporation and maintenance of technological tools.** The delegations highlighted that it is common to think that the sole existence of technological tools is sufficient for their sustained use over time. However, it is necessary that their incorporation goes side-by-side with awareness-raising and training efforts, and that their use is promoted in the different stages of the inspection process, including planning, targeting, development and monitoring.
 - **Optimize the use of available technological resources.** Prioritize the incorporation of technology in tools and processes with greater use and impact. Focus technological resources on areas and sectors where higher levels of non-compliance have been identified.
 - **Strengthen regional and international cooperation** -including regional and international financial institutions, and relevant multilateral agencies- not only in terms of technical cooperation, but also in terms of financing **to reinforce access to technology and other necessary means for labor inspection.**
- In addition, it was recommended that **technological tools be functional and accessible.** In this regard, the following aspects were highlighted:
 - **Territorial accessibility.** Technological tools need to include offline working mechanisms (without internet) or with other forms of connection, so their use is just as effective in areas without connectivity. Likewise, there was a mention on the importance of these technological tools to adapt to the dynamics of inspections in rural areas, hand-in-hand with the necessary legal adjustments. Delegations referred to the contribution that the use of drones has generated in hard-to-reach regions.
 - **Accessibility for inspectors.** IT tools should be sufficiently accessible for the inspectors who will use them. Therefore, it is extremely important to improve and deepen the training and professionalization of inspectors in digital skills and the use of information and communication technologies (ICTs) and sustain it continuously over time.
 - **Accessibility for users.** Delegations stressed that, in efforts to incorporate ICTs into labor inspection, it is crucial to think about their accessibility for the users -workers and employers-. It should be considered that the IT inspection systems must be accessible and uncomplicated, and that there should not be a cost for enterprises or for anyone who is seeking information through the web or has to complete any online procedure or form.

- The **interconnection of databases from different government entities** was considered of great importance. In this regard, the following recommendations were highlighted:
 - **Develop information articulation strategies** through digital platforms; **database integration** and, where possible, **creation of common databases**; as well as **interoperability of systems**, among others.
 - **Ensure that the interconnection between databases is sustainable over time** through alliances, agreements, policies, and even regulations that institutionalize such efforts. This with the objective that the information does not depend solely on political will or circumstantial agreements.
 - **Expand the interconnection of inspection systems to systems that register social organizations.** In such a way that, when the inspector carries out an inspection action, it is possible to know which organizations are involved in the workplace, and thus can obtain key information that allows him or her to better prepare the visit.

2.2. Recommendations on the need to implement a preventive approach to labor law compliance

- **Complement the merely punitive vision of labor inspection with the exploration of new ways for the inspection function to take a more proactive role in labor law compliance.** Participants suggested initiatives including the creation of educational and information tools to encourage voluntary compliance with labor regulations by workers and employers.
- **Discuss the strengthening and effectiveness of the deterrent effect of sanctions**, so that they function as an incentive to promote labor law compliance.
- Institutionalize the preventive approach to labor law compliance so that it transcends over time. This presupposes the existence of State/National policies, which are independent of a particular situation or government. Building **consensus through tripartite social dialogue is crucial to formulating State/National policies.**
- Delegations pointed out that a preventive approach starts with the **community's perception of the Ministries, specifically on labor inspection.** In this regard, it was recommended to analyze the scope of information and the image provided by the ministries across their platforms. The following recommendations emerged:
 - **Develop partnerships with the media and ensure a greater presence of the Ministries of Labor -and their Inspection authorities-** to democratize the information and the benefits of voluntary labor law compliance.
 - **Provide clear and accessible information for all recipients**, this implies that the communication channels used by the Ministries of Labor are close to their interlocutors.
 - **Explore new channels and partners to disseminate information on labor rights**, present information in a user-friendly way, and use creative and innovative methods.

- **Continue using social media to promote workers' rights**, including reference to available complaint channels. More accessible media, such as social networks, can be leveraged by Ministries to develop dissemination and advisory plans, always encouraging self-compliance with the regulations.
- To strengthen the mainstreaming of a gender and inclusion perspective in labor inspection was also recommended, even though this is not directly linked to either of the two topics covered during the workshop.

EVALUATION OF THE WORKSHOP

At the end of the workshop, participants received a survey to evaluate the contents and methodology of the event. The survey was answered by 24 people, including representatives of Ministries of Labor, workers and employers.

The results show that, during the workshop, the participants increased their capacities to perform in each of the thematic areas discussed, as shown in the following table:

On a 1 to 10 scale, qualify your capacity (as you would perceive) to work in the following areas before and after this Workshop*		
	Before the Workshop	After the Workshop
Knowledge on labor inspection	7.17	8.63
Knowledge on use of innovative approaches and new technologies in labor inspection	6.08	8.38
Knowledge on preventive approach to labor law enforcement	6.75	8.38
<i>*Average of responses from 24 participants representing Ministries of Labor, workers and employers.</i>		

Participants were also asked about different statements, rating from 1 to 5 whether they agree with each of them, with 1 being “strongly disagree” and 5 being “strongly agree”. The responses were very positive, corroborating that the Workshop was relevant, positive and provided valuable tools for the work of the Ministries of Labor:

- To the statement “The topics covered are relevant to the realities and challenges of labor law compliance in my country”, the average response was 4.63 (close to “strongly agree”).
- When asked if they consider that the knowledge and skills attained will improve their performance at work, the participants gave an average rating of 4.30.
- Regarding the statement “This Workshop has inspired me to try new ideas, methods and practices in my work”, the participants ranged from *agree* to *strongly agree* (average of 4.43).

- Regarding “I got useful information during the Workshop that will contribute to strengthen strategies to improve labor law compliance in my country”, the average response was 4.45 (between “agree” and “strongly agree”).

As a complement to the last statement, attendees were asked to indicate examples of knowledge acquired in the Workshop that could be applied to their national context. The most mentioned were: 1) integration of technological mechanisms in labor inspection, 2) updating protocols, and 3) good practices related to social dialogue, training and use of technology.

Lastly, attendees provided some inputs and recommendations for future RIAL/OAS Workshops:

- Extend the duration from 2 to 3 days.
- Complement with field visits.
- Keep the methodology of complementing plenary sessions with sub-group exercises.
- Continue to have moderators and facilitators throughout the different sessions who know the topic and stimulate the debate.
- Have repositories of good practices.
- Have access to the event presentations in advance.

ANNEXES

ANNEX No. 1

WORKSHOP'S AGENDA

Tuesday, December 5

8:30 – 9:00 On-site registration and opening of Zoom virtual room for remote participants (EST – Washington D.C. time, *please check local time*)

9:00 – 9:30 **Welcome and opening remarks**

- Kim Osborne, Executive Secretary for Integral Development, Organization of American States (OAS)
- Molly McCoy, Associate Deputy Undersecretary for International Affairs, United States Department of Labor (USDOL)
- Gerardo Corres, Director of International Affairs, Ministry of Labor, Employment and Social Security of Argentina, representing the Chair of the Inter-American Conference of Ministers of Labor

9:30 – 12:30 **1st Session – Innovative technologies in labor inspection**

Moderator: Erin Gilmore, Acting Deputy Director, Directorate of Enforcement Programs, Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA)

Introductory presentation (15 minutes):

- Contextual presentation from the International Labor Organization (ILO), by Teresa Torres, Lead Specialist in Labor Legislation and Labor Administration for the Americas

National experiences (10 to 15 minutes each):

- **Colombia** – Luz Angela Martinez, National Director of Inspection, Ministry of Labor
- **Guyana** – Dhaneshwar Deonarine, Chief Labour Officer, Ministry of Labour
- **Brazil** – Claudio Carvalho Menezes, Labor Inspection Auditor, Secretariat for Labor Inspection, Ministry of Labor and Employment

10:30 – 10:45 *Coffee Break*

Social actors' perspective (10 to 15 minutes each):

- **Workers' representative.** Nahuel Placanica, representing the Chair of the Trade Union Technical Advisory Council (COSATE)
- **Employers' representative.** Laura Gimenez, representing the Chair of Business Technical Advisory Committee on Labor Matters (CEATAL)

Open dialogue among all delegations (1 hour 30 min) – Based on guiding questions

Guiding questions for presentations and dialogue:

1. What innovative practices and/or new technologies is your Ministry of Labor employing to improve the effectiveness of labor inspection in urban and rural areas? Please be as detailed as possible and share challenges and main results.
2. Which elements of success or lessons learned can be drawn from the innovative practices outlined in question 1? What works and why?

12:30 – 2:00 **Lunch** - Offered to all participants by the United States Government
Venue: TL level of the OAS Building

2:00 – 5:00 **2nd Session – Complementing labor inspection: a preventive approach to law enforcement**

Moderator: Yadizeth Ballesteros, Deputy Director of Labor Inspection, Ministry of Labor of Panama, representing the Vice-Chair of IACML Working Group 2

Introductory presentation (15 minutes):

- Presentation from USDOL, by Michael Kravitz, Associate Administrator for Performance and Communication in USDOL’s Wage and Hour Division

National experiences (10 to 15 minutes each):

- **Costa Rica** – Victor Aguilar, National Director of Labor Inspection, Ministry of Labor and Social Security
- **Chile** – Francisco Neira, Legal Advisor of the Ministerial Cabinet, Ministry of Labor and Social Prevision
- **Jamaica** – Gillian Corrods, Divisional Director - Industrial Relations and Allied Services, Ministry of Labour and Social Security

Social actors’ perspective (10 to 15 minutes each):

- **Employers’ representative.** Armando Urtecho, Executive Director, Honduras Council of Private Enterprises (*Consejo Hondureño de la Empresa Privada*), Spokesperson of CEATAL
- **Workers’ representative.** Nahuel Placanica, representing the Chair of COSATE

Open dialogue among all delegations (1 hour 30 min) – Based on guiding questions

Guiding questions for presentations and dialogue:

1. What strategies or initiatives is your institution developing to encourage compliance with labor laws? Please consider including awareness-raising, communication, and education strategies for workers and employers, among other.

2. Which elements of success of lessons learned can be drawn from the strategies or initiatives outlined in question 3? What works and why?

Wednesday, December 6

9:00 – 11:00 **3rd Session – Exercise in sub-groups** – based on guiding question
Moderator: Luz Angela Martinez, National Director of Inspection, Ministry of Labor, representing the Chair of IACML Working Group 2

Explanation of the exercise: María Claudia Camacho, Labor and Employment Section Chief, SEDI, OAS

Guiding question for each sub-group:

5. What key lessons learned, and policy recommendations can be identified, based on the discussions during the Workshop, to: a) strengthen labor inspection, particularly with the use of new technologies, and b) develop a preventive approach to law enforcement?

11:00 – 11:30 **Coffee Break (sub-group rapporteurs define conclusions)**

11:30 – 12:15 **Presentation of sub-groups conclusions**

12:15 – 12:30 **Closing remarks**

- Gerardo Corres, Director of International Affairs, Ministry of Labor, Employment and Social Security of Argentina, representing the Chair of the Inter-American Conference of Ministers of Labor
- Molly McCoy, Associate Deputy Undersecretary for International Affairs, United States Department of Labor
- Jesus Schucry Giacoman, Director, Department of Human Development, Education and Employment, SEDI, Organization of American States (OAS)

12:30 – 2:00 **Closing luncheon offered to all participants by the United States Government**

Venue: TL level of the OAS Building

ANNEX No. 2

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

MEMBER STATES

ARGENTINA

- Joel de Rosa, Director Nacional de Fiscalización, Ministerio de Trabajo, Empleo y Seguridad Social (MTEySS)
- Gerardo Alfredo Corres, Director de Asuntos Internacionales, MTEySS
- Marysol Rodriguez, Jefa de Departamento de Asuntos Regionales y Multilaterales, Dirección de Asuntos Internacionales, MTEySS
- Suyay Cubelli, Jefa de Departamento de Cooperación Internacional y Gestión Técnica, Dirección de Asuntos Internacionales, MTEySS
- Maria Jose Olguín, Analista, Dirección de Asuntos Internacionales, MTEySS
- Thiago Sabato Martins, Analista en la Dirección de Asuntos Internacionales, MTEySS
- María Julia Bellotti, Directora de programación operativa, MTEySS
- Giselle Cazerres, Directora de seguimiento y control, MTEySS
- Ezequiel Federico Cuervo, Asesor, MTEySS
- Alexandra Micaela Domingo, Secretaria, MTEySS
- Juan Manuel Aguilar, Asesor, MTEySS

BAHAMAS

- *Vonchelle Etienne, Administrative Cadet, International Labour Relations Unit, Ministry of Labour and Immigration
- Mikhail Bullard, Minister Counsellor, Alternate Representative, Permanent Mission of The Bahamas to the OAS

BARBADOS

- Randy Clarke, Administrative Officer 1, Ministry of Labour, Social Security and Third Sector

BELIZE

- Aida Reyes, Senior Labour Officer, Ministry of Rural Transformation, Community Development, Labour and Local Government

BOLIVIA

- Yecid Adalid Mollinedo Mejía, Director General de Trabajo, Higiene y Seguridad Ocupacional, Ministerio de Trabajo, Empleo y Previsión Social
- Erika Arteaga, Unidad de Relaciones Internacionales, Ministerio de Trabajo, Empleo y Previsión Social

BRASIL

- Claudio Carvalho Menezes, Auditor Fiscal de Trabajo, Secretaría de Inspección de Trabajo, Ministerio de Trabajo y Empleo

CANADA

- *Rebecca Gowan, Deputy Director, Multilateral Labour Affairs, Labour Program, Employment and Social Development Canada (ESDC)
- *Curtis Connon, Senior Director, National and Regional Operations and Compliance, Labour Program, ESDC
- Mimi Sukhdeo, Regional Director, North West Pacific Region, Labour Program, ESDC
- Deborah Edward, Senior Business Analyst, Regional Operations and Compliance, Labour Program, ESDC
- Mélanie Aumais, Manager, Regional Operations and Compliance, Labour Program, ESDC
- Daniel St. Onge, Manager, Regional Operations and Compliance, Labour Program, ESDC
- Veronique Milot, Manager, Labour Standards Operations, Labour Program, ESDC
- Gohar Tajik, Manager, Occupational Health and Safety Compliance and Operations, Labour Program, ESDC
- Shanaya Singh, Policy Analyst, Multilateral Labour Affairs, Labour Program, ESDC
- Ceayon Johnston, Program Advisor, Occupational Health and Safety Compliance and Operations, Labour Program, ESDC
- Christine Hebert, Technical Advisor, Labour Operations, Labour Program, ESDC

CHILE

- *Francisco Neira Reyes, Coordinador Legislativo, Ministerio del Trabajo y Previsión Social
- *Catalina Vera Toro, Representante Alternativa, Misión Permanente de Chile ante la OEA

COLOMBIA

- *Luz Ángela Martínez Bravo, Directora de Inspección, Vigilancia, Control y Gestión territorial, Ministerio del Trabajo
- Daniela Aragón Salleg, Asesora de la Oficina de Cooperación y Relaciones Internacionales, Ministerio del Trabajo
- Lorena Arboleda Ramírez, Asesora de la Oficina de Cooperación y Relaciones Internacionales, Ministerio del Trabajo

COSTA RICA

- *Alexander Astorga Monge, Viceministro del Área Laboral, Ministerio de Trabajo y Seguridad Social
- *Víctor Aguilar Arias, Director Nacional de Inspección del Trabajo, Ministerio de Trabajo y Seguridad Social
- *Jorge Tortós, Consejero, Misión Permanente de Costa Rica ante la OEA

ECUADOR

- Virginia Lozada, Subsecretaria de Trabajo, Ministerio del Trabajo
- María Gabriela Pico, Subsecretaria de Normativa, Ministerio del Trabajo
- José Javier Hidalgo, Subsecretario de Empleo y Salarios, Ministerio del Trabajo
- María Fernanda Gavilánez, Directora de Control, Inspecciones y Coactivas, Ministerio del Trabajo
- César Mateus, Director de Cooperación y Relaciones Internacionales, Ministerio del Trabajo
- Ana María Cobo, Asesora Ministerial, Ministerio del Trabajo
- Daniela Gallo, Analista de Cooperación y Relaciones Internacionales, Ministerio del Trabajo
- *Sebastián Fonseca, Primer Secretario, Misión Permanente de Ecuador ante la OEA

EL SALVADOR

- Sofía Rodríguez, Viceministra de Trabajo y Previsión Social, Ministerio de Trabajo y Previsión Social (MTPS)
- Joel Adonay de Paz Flores, Asesor de Despacho Ministerial, MTPS

GRENADA

- Sparkle Grenade Courtney, Labour Commissioner (Ag.), Ministry of Legal Affairs, Labour and Consumer Affairs
- Connie McQuilkin, Deputy Labour Commissioner, Ministry of Legal Affairs, Labour and Consumer Affairs
- Rosalie La Grenade, Organization of American States in Grenada

GUATEMALA

- *María Isabel Salazar Urrutia, Viceministra de Administración del Trabajo, Ministerio de Trabajo y Previsión Social
- *Carlos Bautista, Segundo Secretario, Misión Permanente de Guatemala ante la OEA

GUYANA

- *Dhaneshwar Deonarine, Chief Labour Officer, Ministry of Labour

HAITÍ

- Dimanche Inocente, Inspector del Trabajo, Ministerio de Asuntos Sociales y Trabajo
- André Ibreus, Director Asistente del Trabajo, Ministerio de Asuntos Sociales y Trabajo

JAMAICA

- *Gillian Corrodus, Divisional Director, Industrial Relations & Allied Services, Ministry of Labour and Social Security

MEXICO

- *Embajadora Luz Elena Baños Rivas, Representante Permanente de México ante la OEA
- Fernando Jordan Siliceo del Prado, Director General de Inspección Federal del Trabajo, Unidad de Trabajo Digno, Secretaria del Trabajo y Previsión Social (STPS)
- Héctor Pedro Martínez López, Director de Registro de Prestadoras de Servicios Especializados u Obras Especializadas, Unidad de Trabajo Digno, STPS
- Jorge Arturo Ríos Badillo, Director General de Relaciones Institucionales, STPS
- Mara Angélica Salazar Monreal, Directora de Asuntos Hemisféricos, STPS
- Irving Ortiz, Jefe del Departamento de Cooperación Bilateral, STPS
- *Socorro Guadalupe Jorge Cholula, Representante Alterna de México ante la OEA

PANAMÁ

- *Yadizeth Ballesteros, Subdirectora de Inspección de Trabajo, Ministerio de Trabajo y Desarrollo Laboral (MITRADEL)
- Ahychel Elías, Jefa de Oficina de Cooperación Técnica Internacional, MITRADEL
- Vielka Vigil, Oficina de Cooperación Técnica Internacional, MITRADEL
- Sixto Ruedas, MITRADEL
- *María Fernanda Caballero, Tercera Secretaria, Misión Permanente de Panamá ante la OEA

PARAGUAY

- *César Augusto Segovia Villasanti, Viceministro de Trabajo, Ministerio de Trabajo, Empleo y Seguridad Social
- *Ignacio Cazaña, Misión Permanente de Paraguay ante la OEA

PERÚ

- *Lelia Lourdes Lazo Cornejo, Jefa de Gabinete de Asesores, Ministerio de Trabajo y Promoción del Empleo (MTPE)
- Luis Alberto Serrano Díaz, Director de la Dirección de Inteligencia Inspectiva, Superintendencia Nacional de Fiscalización Laboral (SUNAFIL), MTPE
- Luis Jorge Pitta Pereyra, Director de la Dirección de Prevención y Promoción, SUNAFIL-MTPE
- Lázaro Paúl Mendoza Sulca, Especialista Legal de la Dirección de Políticas y Regulación para la Promoción de Formalización Laboral, Inspección del Trabajo y Capacitación y Difusión Laboral, MTPE
- Ronald Bermejo Castillo, Asesor de Despacho, SUNAFIL-MTPE
- Ángela Rodríguez, Asistente en Gabinete de Asesores, MTPE
- *Kelve Maritza Morales Cuba, Representante Alterna del Perú ante la OEA; Misión Permanente del Perú ante la OEA

REPÚBLICA DOMINICANA

- Andrés Valentín Herrera, Director General de Trabajo, Ministerio de Trabajo
- Juan Ventura, Director para las Inspecciones, Ministerio de Trabajo

SAINT KITTS AND NEVIS

- Astric Wyatt-Archibald, Labour Officer IV & Head – International Labour Relations Department, Ministry of Employment and Labour
- Jewel Wattley, Labour Officer IV & Head - Policy, Legislation, Research and Statistics Department, Ministry of Employment and Labour

SAINT LUCIA

- Joseph Joseph, Labour Commissioner, Department of Labour

SAINT VINCENT AND THE GRENADINES

- *Racquel Jacobs-Lawrence, Labour Commissioner, Labour Department, Ministry of Labour
- Avette Abbott, Administrative Officer II, Ministry of Labour

SURINAME

- *Merlien Adriaans Nelson, Regional Head, Labor Inspection, Ministry of Labour, Technological Development and Environment
- Maureen Samuels, Acting Head of the Education and Training Office, Labour Inspection

TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO

- *Farouk Mohammed, Chief Labour Inspector Specialist, Ministry of Labour
- Nicole Thomas, Labour Inspector II (Ag.), Research and Planning Division, Ministry of Labour
- Taramatie Rampersad, Labour Inspector II, Research and Planning Division, Ministry of Labour
- Indira Dookiesingh, Labour Inspector II, Research and Planning Division, Ministry of Labour

UNITED STATES

- *Molly McCoy, Associate Deputy Undersecretary for International Affairs, U.S. Department of Labor
- *Sarah Morgan, Director, Office of International Relations and Economic Research, U.S. Department of Labor
- *Michael Kravitz, Wage and Hour Division, U.S. Department of Labor
- *Erin Gilmore, Acting Deputy Director, Directorate of Enforcement Programs, Occupational Safety and Health Administration
- *Carolina Rizzo, J.D. Senior Advisor on Western Hemisphere Affairs, Office of International Relations and Economic Research, International Labor Affairs Bureau, U.S. Department of Labor
- *Jennifer Kole, International Affairs Coordinator, Occupational Safety and Health Administration, U.S. Department of Labor
- *Julianna Aynes-Neville, Development Counselor, U.S. Permanent Mission to the OAS, Department of State
- *Christina Heifferon, Alternate Representative, U.S. Permanent Mission to the OAS, Dept.of State
- *Angela Telang, Wage and Hour Division, U.S. Department of Labor
- *Naixa Franquiz, Wage and Hour Division, U.S. Department of Labor
- *Daniel Navarrete, Wage and Hour Division, U.S. Department of Labor

URUGUAY

- María Silvana Bitencourt Machado, Subinspectora General del Trabajo y de la Seguridad Social, Ministerio de Trabajo y Seguridad Social
- Nataly Rodríguez, Abogada Asesora de la Dirección General de Secretaría

PAISES OBSERVADORES / OBSERVER COUNTRIES

España

- Cristina Fernández González, Directora de la Oficina Nacional de Lucha Contra el Fraude, Organismo Estatal Inspección de Trabajo y Seguridad Social
- *Marcos Fraile, Consejero de Trabajo, Migraciones y Seguridad Social en la Embajada de España en EEUU

ÓRGANOS CONSULTIVOS

Comisión Empresarial de Asesoramiento Técnico en Asuntos Laborales / Business Technical Advisory Committee on Labor Matters (CEATAL)

- *Armando Urtecho, Director Ejecutivo, Consejo Hondureño de la Empresa Privada (COHEP)
- Laura Gimenez, Unión Industrial Argentina
- Luis Rodrigo Morales, Director de Relaciones Industriales y Coordinación OIT, OIE
- Lourdes Cardona, Oficial Unidad de Empresas y Derechos Humanos, COHEP

Consejo Sindical de Asesoramiento Técnico (COSATE)

- *Nahuel Placanica, representante de la Presidenta de COSATE
- Julio Rosales, Unión Obrera de la Construcción de la República Argentina
- Gabriela Prado, Unión Obrera de la Construcción de la República Argentina

ORGANISMOS INTERNACIONALES / INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS

Organización Internacional del Trabajo (OIT)

- *Teresa Torres, Especialista Principal en Legislación Laboral y Administración del Trabajo, OIT

Organización de los Estados Americanos (OEA) / Organization of American States (OAS)

- *Maryse Robert, Directora del Departamento de Desarrollo Económico, SEDI
- *Jesús Schucry Giacomán, Director del Departamento de Desarrollo Humano, Educación y Empleo (DHDEE), SEDI
- *María Claudia Camacho, Jefa de Sección de Trabajo y Empleo, DHDEE, SEDI
- *Mariana Vieyra, Oficial de Programas, Sección de Trabajo y Empleo, DHDEE, SEDI
- Kristell Blas Herrera, Pasante de la Sección de Trabajo y Empleo, DHDEE, SEDI

*In-person participants