



ORGANIZATION OF AMERICAN STATES
Inter-American Council for Integral Development
(CIDI)



PLANNING MEETING OF THE AUTHORITIES

CIDI Ministerial Process - Labor

February 22, 2024

Washington, D.C.

(Virtual Meeting)

OEA/Ser. L/XIX

CIDI/CIMT/RPA/doc.48/24

31 January 2024

Original: Spanish

OUTCOMES AND RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE RIAL WORKSHOP “TOWARDS A
STRONGER COORDINATION BETWEEN EDUCATION AND LABOR IN THE
AMERICAS”



More rights
for more people

Ministerio
de Educación

Ministerio de Trabajo,
Empleo y Seguridad Social



Argentina
Presidencia

Workshop “Towards a Stronger Coordination between Education and Labor in the Americas”

May 4 and 5, 2023

Buenos Aires, Argentina (Hybrid)

In-person & Virtual

OUTCOMES AND RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE WORKSHOP:

“Towards a Stronger Coordination between Education and Labor in the Americas”

4th - 5th May 2023 – Buenos Aires, Argentina and on-line

CONTENT

Introduction	1
1. Main ideas and agreements	3
2. Lessons learned and recommendations for strengthening education-labor coordination	5
3. Lessons learned and recommendations for the development of National Qualifications Frameworks	8
4. Recommendations towards the design of a Regional Qualifications Framework	10
5. Considerations regarding inter-American cooperation	12
Annex 1 – Workshop agenda	14
Annex 2 – List of Participants	18

INTRODUCTION

The Workshop "Towards a Stronger Coordination between Education and Labor in the Americas" took place on May 4th and 5th, 2023, in a hybrid format, in Buenos Aires, Argentina. It involved the participation of 27 countries from the region, represented by delegations from Ministries of Labor and/or Ministries of Education, workers’ and employers’ representatives – under the leadership of the President of the Business Technical Advisory Committee in Labor Matters (CEATAL) and the President of Trade Union Technical Advisory Council (COSATE) –, Spain's representation as an observer country of the OAS, and representatives from the International Labour Organization (ILO), the Labor Technical Group of the Pacific Alliance, and the Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC). The Workshop was sponsored by the Ministries of Labor and Education of Argentina, in their capacities as Chairs of the Inter-American Conference of Ministers of Labour (IACML) and the Inter-American Committee on Education (CIE), respectively. Furthermore, it was an activity of the Inter-American Network for Labor Administration (RIAL) of the OAS.

The Workshop responded to the mandates of the Ministers of Labor and Education of the Americas, expressed in the Declaration and Plan of Action of Buenos Aires adopted at the XXI IACML in

2021, the IACML Work Plan 2022-2024, the Hemispheric Education Plan of Action, and the CIE Work Plan for the period 2022-2025, related to improving the coordination between education, labor, and professional training, and promoting national and regional qualifications frameworks.

In line with the ministerial mandates and commitments, the general objective of the Workshop was to increase knowledge and strengthen the capacities of the Ministries of Labor and Education to move towards greater intersectoral coordination, especially around national and regional qualifications frameworks. The following were proposed as specific objectives: exchange and analyze experiences of collaboration and/or coordination between Ministries of Labor and Education in the region; exchange information on the state of progress, the successes, and challenges in the development of national qualifications frameworks in the different countries of the region; discuss and explore possible steps to follow to design a regional qualifications framework; and identify lessons learned and policy recommendations to strengthen the coordination between Ministries of Labor and Ministries of Education and the development of national qualifications frameworks.

To meet the stated objectives, the Workshop had two thematic sessions, the first on experiences of coordination between Ministries of Labor and Education, and the second on National Qualifications Frameworks; both had guiding questions to frame the discussion. Within the sessions there were presentations of demonstrative experiences from Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Jamaica, Mexico, Peru, and Suriname, which, for the most part, were carried out jointly between the Ministries of Education and Labor. There were also ample spaces for dialogue where Ministries and representatives of workers and employers were able to share their experiences and perspectives.

On the second day of the event, a sub-groups exercise was carried out so that the participants could discuss in greater depth and collectively respond three questions:

- What are the main successes and lessons learned from the actions of coordination between the Ministries of Education and Labor?
- What lessons learned can be synthesized to further advance in national qualifications framework? and
- What public policy recommendations can be made to promote and improve the coordination between the Ministries of Labor and Education?

3 sub-groups were formed (2 virtual and 1 in person), with government delegates from Jamaica, Colombia and Chile as moderators and rapporteurs. The delegations of the participating Ministries, as well as representatives of workers and employers, ILO (represented by the Inter-American Centre for Knowledge Development in Vocational Training – CINTERFOR) and the Labor Technical Group of the Pacific Alliance, actively participated in the subgroups.

This document gathers the main ideas and recommendations that emerged from the Workshop, both from its thematic sessions and from the sub-groups exercise, to strengthen the coordination between the Ministries of Labor and the Ministries of Education and encourage the development of national qualifications frameworks.

1. MAIN IDEAS AND AGREEMENTS

- There is a **broad consensus around the need to improve the coordination between education and labor in the Americas**; during the Workshop, various considerations and arguments were outlined to support this need:
 - **The relation between education, working conditions and social inclusion.** In the Americas, as in other regions of the world, the possibility of having a job increases considerably with a higher level of education; likewise, the probability that this job will be decent, productive, protected, and well-paid depends to a large extent on the level and quality of education. It should suffice to cite the situation of informal employment, characterized by precariousness and lack of rights, to corroborate this statement: 79.2% of women and 70.3% of men who have completed primary education have informal employment; these percentages are considerably reduced to 35% and 32.5% respectively for women and men who have tertiary education.¹ Breaking the cycle of inter-generational reproduction of poverty requires improving the quality, equity, inclusion, and relevance of education and guaranteeing a better insertion into the world of work - improving the school-to-work transition- of all segments of the population, especially those traditionally marginalized and excluded.
 - **The difficult situation of youth employment and the so-called skills gap.** Young people consistently have higher unemployment rates than those of the general population - 15.8% compared to 7.2% in the regional average for 2022-, they are overrepresented in the informal sector -60% of the informality rate among young people compared to 47% for adults in 2022²- and a large percentage does not study or work. Meanwhile, companies in Latin America and the Caribbean state that they are unable to find the talent and skills they need.³
 - **The repercussions of the disconnection between the training offer and the labor market.** An education and training offer that does not respond to the needs and demands of the productive sector leads, in the aggregate, to less economic development and higher unemployment, and, at the individual level, to great frustration.
 - **The commitment to "lifelong learning."** There is currently no discussion of the need to guarantee "lifelong learning," which implies facilitating the acquisition of knowledge and skills, as well as recognizing and certifying competences acquired both within and outside of formal education.
- The delegations recognized that strengthening education-labor coordination has been a regional priority for at least three decades and that **progress has been slow**. This is due to multiple factors, including philosophical, ideological and political considerations, budgetary and public administration issues, and technical and planning difficulties, among others.

¹ OIT (2023). Op.cit.

² OIT (2023). 2022 Labor Overview of Latin America and the Caribbean.

³ Consult as an example: Manpower Group: Talent Shortage Survey and World Bank Enterprise Surveys.

- There is also consensus that **strengthening education-labor coordination is currently of greater urgency** due, on the one hand, to technological changes and the transformations that these produce in both education and the world of work and, on the other hand, considering the disproportionate negative effects of the pandemic in certain population groups, such as women and young people, and the need to respond to them through education, training and employability.
- A recurring theme that was emphasized throughout the dialogue was **placing people as the central axis of the present agenda for education-labor coordination**. By putting people at the center, the protection of personal and professional development is guaranteed through education, access to decent work and a social justice approach that promotes inclusion and equity.
- There is also consensus on the importance of incorporating an **inclusion dimension, a gender and intersectional perspective, as well as the unrestricted respect for human rights** in all actions and policies developed around education and employment. Achieving equality and improving social well-being must be paramount considerations in all decisions and implemented measures.
- In the discussions it was endorsed that **education and labor, in addition to being fundamental human rights, are essential instruments** to guarantee equal opportunities and access to a dignified life.
- It was recognized that **the education-labor coordination does not occur in a vacuum and that it responds to development models** and visions of each country. The development model sets the context for developing intersectoral, coherent, and coordinated policies, which are also able to adapt to changing times. This was particularly highlighted by workers' representatives.
- Having **specific spaces for participation, exchange, and dialogue** between the education and labor sectors is essential to achieve greater alignment, but progress will largely depend on the attitude and openness of the individuals involved. It is important to listen to and understand the other sector, to know how it operates, what regulations it has, as well as the territorial and local peculiarities. Each sector should comprehend the distinct dynamics of the other.
- The governments and the representatives of workers and employers were explicit about the **importance of institutionalized social dialogue** in the definition, implementation and monitoring of intersectoral public policies. In this context, the need to promote union training, strengthen collective bargaining, and ensure full respect for freedom of association was recognized.
- The need to **have evidence on the impact of education and labor policies** on people's lives and on development indicators in general was stressed; as well as the important role of research and innovation to support strategies and policies at the national and regional level.
- **National qualification frameworks (NQF) were highlighted as concrete tools to facilitate coordination** and address the various challenges present at the intersection between education and labor. These instruments, of a unique nature, have the task of organizing qualifications into hierarchical levels, which makes it possible to strengthen the relationship between the world of

work and education. The participating countries recognized the various uses of national qualification frameworks, as well as a series of differentiating factors for their implementation, guided by the ILO-CINTERFOR presentation. Among the general applications of NQF that stood out:

- They promote recognition of lifelong learning
 - They provide support to companies, placement agencies and employment services to reconcile labor supply and demand
 - They guide people in their training options
 - They facilitate adaptation to technological and future changes in the workplace
- Similarly, some key ideas were mentioned to move towards a **Regional Qualifications Framework**. Many participants expressed their enthusiasm for the possibilities this could offer, highlighting the potential benefits both for countries with existing national frameworks (through a mapping exercise) and for those that do not yet have one (by promoting its creation). Likewise, the importance of maintaining a continuous intersectoral dialogue at the international level to facilitate its eventual development was emphasized.

2. LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR STRENGTHENING EDUCATION-LABOR COORDINATION

During the presentations of national experiences, as well as in the open dialogue spaces and in the sub-groups, participants were able to share and identify some lessons learned and recommendations on what has worked and may work to improve education-labor coordination. These lessons learned and recommendations are listed below:

- **Have a policy framework that reinforces and directs intersectoral coordination.** This implies designing and developing medium- and long-term national policies that clearly establish intersectoral responsibilities and actions. Mention was made of the National Decent Employment Policy of Peru (*Política Nacional de Empleo Decente*), whose priority objectives explicitly order actions to be developed jointly by the Ministries of Labor and Education.
- Generate **pathways or bridges** between the formal education system, the job training system, and all educational levels to allow people a smooth transition between these systems and recognition of their learning. To generate pathways between formal, informal and non-formal education was also mentioned.
- Improve the processes of **skills certification**, allowing for the recognition of skills acquired outside the formal educational environment or, in a broader sense, the recognition of prior learning. There is a great urgency to recognize and certify these skills, understanding the very positive impact this process has on increasing employability, especially for those populations in conditions of greater vulnerability. The region has valuable initiatives and institutions with extensive expertise in certifying competencies, such as the National Council for Normalization and Certification of Labor Competencies (CONOCER) in Mexico, ChileValora, and Canada's Red Seal program.

- Strengthen **instances of multisectoral dialogue incorporating local, regional and sectoral perspectives** to improve job training policies. Since these policies depend on the design of professional profiles in each economic sector, relevant tools are required to anticipate and satisfy the demand for skills in the labor market. To achieve this, it is essential to redouble efforts in intersectoral work to involve a broader set of actors such as the Ministries of Economy or Finance, Science and Technology, Production, Social Development, among others, as well as workers' and employers' organizations.
- **Implement a comprehensive, coherent, and coordinated set of public policies** that address inequalities in access to education and work, including connectivity, care, and social protection policies, among others.
- **Improve and give greater emphasis to teacher training.** Mention was made in particular of the urgency of training teachers in new technologies and innovative technological applications to close the digital skills gap and better respond to the changes in the world of work (future of work). The digital transformation and the accelerated changes in education and employment have created great pressure and demands on teachers, who must strengthen both their own digital skills and their ability to develop them in their students. In this context, the COSATE delegation raised as a priority ensuring and promoting teachers' rights -including the rights of freedom of association and collective bargaining- in order to achieve decent conditions of employment that include decent wages, training, and safe and healthy working environments.
- **Strengthen the labor market information systems (LMIS)** to obtain solid and updated data in order to provide feedback and improve the definition of contents in education and training systems. Governments and social actors should prioritize the use of this information in decision-making processes. The LMIS should include not only information on job supply and demand, but labor market analysis, identification of trends, salaries and profiles of different sectors and occupations, as well as, where possible, prospective analysis and forecasts. The experience of Mexico was highlighted, whose system not only collects information from formal sources such as the survey of occupations or administrative records, but also carries out a process of scrapping vacancies in order to have complete information on the labor market.
- **Revalue technical and vocational education**, including strategies to change the social perception of it that has relegated it to a second category education. This implies criticizing the stratification of technical education based on an artificial opposition between "doing" and "thinking." This was highlighted particularly by the Caribbean countries, led by the Minister of Labour of Guyana; furthermore, in terms of technical and vocational education and training (TVET), the ecosystem of Jamaica stands out (The Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) ecosystem), which has transversally incorporated notions of TVET in primary and secondary education, and has aligned TVET to the national and regional (Caribbean) qualifications framework. The experience of Suriname also stands out, where TVET components are included in primary and secondary education, under the concept of "work-based learning."

- Provide education and training systems with **instruments/actions that allow them to adapt quickly to changing contexts**, this includes making educational curricula more flexible and making the procedures for developing and modifying professional training courses/disciplines more expeditious (it was recognized that it currently takes too long to decommission obsolete courses or create new courses.)
- **Direct education and training towards the development of skills and adopt a proactive approach in their updating and improvement.** During the event it was recognized that the world is changing very rapidly and that education and training systems cannot be transformed and adapted at the same pace; this also implies that the demands of the productive sector are constantly changing and that it is very difficult to predict future training needs. One way to respond to this challenge is to focus on skills development, training in skills not in occupations. In this effort, it is important to implement measures that make it possible to address outdated or obsolete skills, develop transferable and foundational skills, train in digital skills in response to the changing needs of the productive sector and the economy in general, among others.
- **Promote upskilling or reskilling programs**, especially for the adult population and in sectors particularly affected by technological change or where there is a significant transformation of required skills.
- Develop strategies and actions to establish **agreements with workers' and employers' representative organizations** in order to achieve better alignment between education and training with employment; these include understanding skills and human capital needs; advising companies to better define their vacancy profiles and identify the skills associated with them; and training companies to develop inclusive selection and hiring processes.
- **Promote and strengthen internship programs and apprenticeships**, and other models that facilitate the school-to-work transition, enhancing both the quality and quantity of these experiences to make them relevant, realistic, and modern, thus benefiting a larger number of individuals.
- **Deepen and enhance youth employment strategies and facilitate school-to-work transition**, acknowledging the challenges that youth face in the labor market regarding unemployment, informality, and inactivity. Vocational guidance, employment intermediation, and public employment services stand out, among others, as areas where the Ministries of Education and Labor can collaborate.
- **Promote the training and development of skills of the personnel of the Ministries of Labor and Education** that are relevant to achieve intersectoral coordination, this includes having a better understanding of the phenomena, challenges and policies associated with both sectors.

3. LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF NATIONAL QUALIFICATIONS FRAMEWORKS

A significant portion of the Workshop was dedicated to national qualification frameworks, considering that their development is relatively recent in the region and progress varies from one country to another. Consequently, fostering exchange and cooperation on these frameworks is highly relevant and valuable. The discussion was framed by an introductory presentation by ILO-CINTERFOR and the experiences of Chile, Colombia, and Costa Rica, the three countries in the region that have made the most progress in developing these instruments. Below are the lessons learned and recommendations identified during the Workshop, stemming from the presentations, open dialogue sessions, and subgroup exercises, in relation to the creation and implementation of national qualification frameworks:

- Having an **interinstitutional political agreement at the national level** to develop the framework was a strong recommendation during the Workshop. The existence of this agreement lends legitimacy to the framework and, operationally, facilitates its implementation. There was consensus among the delegations regarding the importance of making the frameworks a part of the National policy, as opposed to a government policy, in order to ensure their permanence and sustainability over time.
- Linked to the previous recommendation, the significant value of **having legislation that supports and guides the process** of creating and implementing the framework was identified. Such legislation provides certainty and clarity regarding the responsibilities and roles of the various institutions involved.
- **Ensuring the participation of all social actors in the framework construction process**, not only in the validation process. Having the presence of the private sector, workers' organizations, associations, professional bodies, chambers of commerce, among others, during the construction process is essential to ensure that the initial document reflects consensus from all social actors. This was a highlighted lesson, particularly emphasized by the Chilean delegation. It was recognized that this participation also helps ensure that agreements transcend government periods and transform frameworks and qualification systems into National policies.
- Establishing a **clear and robust institutional framework and governance** for the construction, updating, and implementation of qualification frameworks. In this regard, various points were highlighted:
 - o In terms of governance, the Ministries of Education and Labor can lead the process (in most existing frameworks, the Ministry of Education takes the lead), but the work should be guided by a broader interinstitutional political agreement, as previously indicated.
 - o The responsibilities and roles of each participating institution must be clearly defined.
 - o The governance bodies of the frameworks in almost all countries include Ministries of Education and Labor, training institutes, universities, representatives of employers and workers. This allows collaboration among stakeholders in education, training, and employment to arrive at a common language.
 - o Within the governance structure, it is important to have a high-level political decision-making body that provides guidelines and directions, as well as a technical body responsible for continuous monitoring, overseeing operational aspects of the framework,

and ensuring frequent and coordinated dialogue. This was cited as a success for the frameworks in Colombia and Costa Rica.

- Before initiating the framework construction, **the various stakeholders must discuss and define what type of framework they should develop**, as well as clearly define its scope, uses, and impact, in order to avoid generating exaggerated or short-term expectations. Consider whether, according to the country's realities and needs, a communicative, reformative, or transformative framework is required, or if there is a need for a general or specific framework. Also, inherent tensions of qualification frameworks should be taken into account, both at the national level and between a national and regional framework, or among different productive sectors. The clear definition of the scope and nature of the National Qualifications Framework for Education Careers (*Marco Nacional de Cualificaciones para las Carreras de Educación - MNCCE-CR*) in Costa Rica was identified as one of its strengths.
- NQFs aim, among their objectives, to **build bridges between education and professional training, and to establish educational and occupational pathways**. To achieve these objectives, it is essential that both education institutions and training organizations, workers' and employers' organizations, and individuals undergoing education and training, are aware of and use the frameworks (usability of qualifications was discussed during the Workshop). Colombia highlighted a significant advancement in the endorsement of universities, which recognize and incorporate the Framework into the formulation of their academic offerings.
- Incorporate a **quality assurance approach** throughout the entire NQF process, from registering qualifications in the framework to evaluation and certification. To ensure that qualifications are valued and credible, they must be of high quality.
- Have **strong communication and dissemination strategies** for NQFs. Some of the elements discussed in this regard include:
 - Utilize a multi-channel dissemination system, ranging from social media usage to meetings, to communicate the benefits and utility of the framework to all stakeholders impacted by its implementation.
 - Clearly communicate to actors and users, addressing myths surrounding frameworks, their scope, benefits, and limitations.
 - Adapt communication to the audience, which involves tailoring messages to different target audiences and emphasizing the benefits of the Framework. For example, for students and workers, highlighting the advantage of the NQF in defining educational and occupational pathways.
 - Integrate the NQF into **school programs or curricula** to ensure widespread dissemination and knowledge among the entire student population.
- Highlighting and keeping in mind, both during the implementation of the Frameworks and in communication strategies, that the **Frameworks are tools that underpin the concept of lifelong learning**. It is recognized that learning does not only take place in a classroom, that there are multiple spaces where knowledge and skills are acquired throughout life. The utility of the Frameworks lies in their ability to recognize and respond to different areas of learning and human development during the life cycle. It was mentioned that the Frameworks represent an opportunity to revalue, appreciate, and provide reliability to various types of learning.

- **Building and maintaining trust among the public, private and social actors** involved in the qualification framework was a widely discussed recommendation and lesson learned throughout the event. Some of the actions proposed in relation to this recommendation include:
 - Maintaining constant and transparent communication with all involved stakeholders.
 - Fostering open and comprehensive dialogue among actors and users of the qualification framework.
 - Creating concrete intersectoral dialogue spaces, while also maintaining separate spaces for the realms of education and work.

- **Develop innovative Frameworks that address major developmental trends.** During the discussion, some challenges and priorities that frameworks should consider (or to which frameworks should respond) were mentioned, such as:
 - Including environmental perspectives and a just transition in all aspects related to learning, both in vocational training and education. This has implications for the NQF.
 - Incorporating movements towards micro-certifications and skill-centered engagement.
 - Linking the NQF with structural changes in the economy and significant development initiatives. Among others, the NQF could serve as a vehicle to achieve food sovereignty, energy transition, and new directions in public policy.

- **Documenting the use and impact of NQFs on individuals and the country as a whole.** In this regard, it was suggested to create a joint annual report between ministries, based on the monitoring and evaluation of the framework's performance.

4. RECOMMENDATIONS TOWARDS THE DESIGN OF A REGIONAL QUALIFICATIONS FRAMEWORK

In alignment with one of the Workshop's objectives, which was to discuss and explore potential steps to design a regional qualifications framework, delegations had the opportunity to exchange their perspectives on designing a Regional Framework for Latin America and the Caribbean. They drew from some lessons learned about the coordination between education and labor in the context of the Pacific Alliance. Below are several considerations, ideas, and recommendations that emerged from this exchange:

- In general, government delegations **expressed interest and enthusiasm about the possibilities that a Regional Framework could offer**, and they recognized several benefits of this tool, including its capacity to address challenges posed by intra-regional migration, the demands and needs of the business sector, workforce re-skilling, and skills for the future.

- **Having a Regional Framework can bring benefits** to both countries that already possess an NQF, as it compels them to identify areas for improvement and establish correlations with the Regional Framework, and to countries that do not yet have a national framework, as it allows them to streamline the process of framework development.

- In the experience of the Pacific Alliance, as well as in the explorations conducted by ILO-CINTERFOR, OAS, and UNESCO regarding a Regional Framework, the usefulness and necessity of having a **horizontal a collaborative learning environment among countries** at the technical level become evident. The Regional Framework becomes an important platform to achieve this collaborative learning.
- Furthermore, the Regional Framework also serves as a space where countries could **explore collective strategies related to the use of qualifications**, particularly their application in designing educational offerings.
- Having a **Regional Framework for this Hemisphere allows countries to reference other regional frameworks**, adopt relevant international qualification standards, and perform comparative assessments (benchmarking). These standards could be incorporated into the training offerings.
- **Regional Frameworks come with challenges and difficulties.** During the Workshop, the following were mentioned: the existence of diverse education and professional training structures, varying levels of informality, and differing labor market realities; as well as the heterogeneity of industries and productive sectors (for instance, mining might be a priority in some countries, while in others it might be non-existent or emerging).
- In the presentation from the Labor Technical Group of the Pacific Alliance on **education-labor coordination, the following lessons emerged**, which could prove valuable in establishing a Regional Qualifications Framework:
 - o The institutional architecture of governments involved in supranational initiatives is diverse (for instance, professional training institutes in most countries fall under Ministries of Labor, but not in all). Paying attention to this diversity facilitates the development of collaborations. In these efforts, it is crucial to assess institutions based on the objectives to be achieved, rather than their position in the institutional structure.
 - o The institutional structure and governance schemes of multilateral institutions or regional groupings must be regarded as unchangeable conditions when designing initiatives that require education-labor coordination. Accounting for this structure can significantly impact the political momentum and commitment necessary to advance such initiatives.
 - o Having detailed mappings of relevant institutions and actors at supranational, regional, national, and sectoral levels, among others, can amplify the results and impacts of education-labor coordination actions. It is essential to clarify which institutions should be involved in different processes and initiatives, determining who should be at the table.
 - o Formalizing coordination relationships through administrative and/or legal instruments (collaboration agreements, memorandums of understanding, etc.) enables the establishment of entities that transcend individuals and changing governments, institutionalizing these coordination relationships and facilitating the cumulative and progressive development of initiatives in both work and education.

- Developing cross-cutting narratives that consider complexities and levels of coordination is an entirely necessary condition. Discourses that strategically involve more actors and are policy-oriented must be constructed, conveying that coordination efforts aim to improve people's quality of life. This approach can yield better achievements and a greater impact.
- Similar to the national level, at the supranational level, it is important to identify the structure from which intersectoral coordination efforts can be facilitated.

5. CONSIDERATIONS REGARDING INTER-AMERICAN COOPERATION

Throughout the Workshop, delegations reaffirmed the value and usefulness of the exchange of experiences and insights that was achieved. They provided numerous comments on inter-American cooperation and the tools available through the OAS to enhance it. The following are the considerations made during the Workshop regarding cooperation.

- Delegations acknowledged the value of having regional spaces for discussion and exchange of experiences, highlighting the opportunity they offer to identify best practices, successes, and challenges, with the aim of designing, guiding, or reformulating national strategies and initiatives.
- The OAS' forums and mechanisms for cooperation and political dialogue were underscored, particularly the Inter-American Commission on Education (CIE) and the Inter-American Conference of Ministers of Labor (IACML), which underpinned the realization of this Workshop. The CIE's Work Plan incorporates horizontal cooperation actions and technical assistance among Ministries of Education, and the IACML features the Inter-American Network for Labor Administration (RIAL) as a cooperation mechanism among Ministries of Labor. Both forums prioritize education-labor coordination.
- Copied from the previous section: "In the experience of the Pacific Alliance, as well as in the explorations conducted by ILO-CINTERFOR, OAS, and UNESCO regarding a Regional Framework, the usefulness and necessity of having a **horizontal collaborative learning environment among countries** at the technical level become evident. The Regional Framework becomes an important platform to achieve this collaborative learning."
- In the development and operation of a Regional Qualifications Framework, cooperation and dialogue among all involved countries are essential, as well as ensuring a clear governance structure. Minister Kismer de Olmos, Minister of Labor of Argentina, pointed out: "The OAS constitutes an important space for sustaining these necessary discussions that contribute to laying the groundwork for the development of a regional qualifications framework, as it maintains an ongoing relationship with our Ministries of Labor and Education in the region through its management processes."
- During the Workshop, the following areas were mentioned as opportunities for regional cooperation:

- Teacher training in innovative technological applications to bridge the skills gap in the labor market.
 - Exchange among business associations and strengthening the participation of the business sector in horizontal technical cooperation. This was highlighted by CEATAL.
 - Exchange among workers' organizations and strengthening union capacities through technical cooperation for trade unions and confederations. This was highlighted by COSATE.
 - The development of national qualifications frameworks and qualification systems. Specifically, interest was expressed in continuing to receive support from ILO/CINTERFOR and the OAS in this regard.
- Take note of replicable strategies and methodologies that have proven their usefulness in the region and delve deeper into refining and perfecting experiences to develop effective, inclusive, and sustainable policies. In this regard, emphasize the **opportunities for knowledge transfer** that can arise among countries in the region.

ANNEX 1 – WORKSHOP AGENDA

Thursday, May 4

8:20 – 9:00 On-site registration and opening of Zoom virtual room for soundchecks (Buenos Aires time, *please check local time*)

9:00 – 9:30 **Welcome and opening remarks**

- Jesús Schucry Giacoman, Director of the Department of Human Development, Education and Employment of the Organization of American States (OAS)
- Andrea García, Secretary of Education Cooperation and Priority Actions, Ministry of Education of Argentina
- Minister Raquel Cecilia Kismer de Olmos, Minister of Labor, Employment and Social Security of Argentina

9:30 – 9:50 **Introductory session**

- Intervention of the Chair of the Inter-American Conference of Ministers of Labor (IACML), by Edith Byk, National Director of Continuing Training, Ministry of Labor, Employment and Social Security of Argentina
- Intervention of the Chair of the Inter-American Committee on Education (CIE), by Marina Larrea, National Director of International Cooperation, Ministry of Education of Argentina

9:50 – 10:00 Coffee break

10:00 – 12:50 **1st Session – Institutional coordination: Concrete experiences of coordination between Ministries of Labor and Education in the region**

Moderator: Marina Larrea, National Director for International Cooperation, Ministry of Education of Argentina

National experiences (20 minutes each):

- **Jamaica** - Dameon Black, Executive Director of the Tertiary Education Commission; Marcia Rowe-Amonde, Director of Curriculum and Learning for the vocational training agency (HEART TRUST/NSTA); and Roy Taylor, Senior Education Officer for Vocational and Technical Education
- **Peru** - Violeta Leyva, Vice-Minister of Employment Promotion and Labor Training, Ministry of Labor and Employment Promotion
- **Mexico** - Rodrigo Ramírez Quintana, Head of the National Employment Service Unit, Ministry of Labor and Social Welfare

- **Suriname** - Daniela Rosario, Deputy Director of Education, Ministry of Education, Science and Technology, and Naomi Esajas-Frierson, Deputy Director of Labor Market, Ministry of Labor, Employment and Youth Affairs.

Social actors' perspective (10 minutes each):

- **Workers' representative.** Marta Pujadas, Chair of the Trade Union Technical Advisory Council (COSATE)
- **Employers' representative.** Laura Giménez of the Industrial Union of Argentina, on behalf of the Chair of the Business Technical Advisory Committee on Labor Matters (CEATAL)

Open dialogue among all delegations (1 hour and 10 minutes)

Guiding questions for the presentations and the dialogue of the 1st session:

- *What are the main areas and actions of coordination between the Ministries of Education and Labor in your country? We suggest considering actions in the field of teacher training, the link between education and professional training, actions to facilitate the school-to-work transition, among others.*
- *What are the main successes and lessons learned from the actions indicated in the previous question?*

12:50 – 14:00 **Break. Lunch offered by the Ministry of Labor, Employment and Social Security of Argentina**

14:00 – 17:00 **2nd Session – The National Qualifications Frameworks as a concrete tool for education-labor coordination**

Moderator: Carmen Lemos Ibarra, Director of Skills Standardization and Quality Certification, Ministry of Labor, Employment and Social Security of Argentina

Introductory presentation:

- Presentation by ILO/CINTERFOR with an overview of the development of national qualifications frameworks in the region, by Fernando Vargas, Lead Specialist (20 minutes)

National experiences (20 minutes each):

- **Chile** - Catalina Estévez, Head of the Area of Articulation with the Technical Vocational Training of Chile Valora, Anita Melo Lagos, Professional of the Department of Training of People of SENCE, and Cristian Lincovil, Executive Secretary of Technical Professional Secondary Education, Ministry of Education
- **Colombia** - Iván Jaramillo, Vice Minister of Employment and Pensions, Judy Caldas, Director of Mobility and Training of the Ministry of Labor and Eliana

Mendieta, Deputy Director of Support to Higher Education Institutions of the Ministry of Education

- **Costa Rica** - Juan Ricardo Wong, Executive Director of the National Council for Higher Education (CONASUP), Ministry of Education

The experience of the Regional Qualifications Framework of the Pacific Alliance

- Presentation by Igor Dedic on behalf of the Alliance's Technical Labor Group (20 minutes)

Open dialogue among all delegations (1 hour and 20 minutes)

Guiding questions for the presentations and the dialogue of the 2nd session:

- *At what stage is the development of the qualifications framework in your country?*
- *What aspects favor and what aspects hinder the formulation of a national qualifications framework?*
- *What lessons learned can be synthesized to further advance in national qualifications frameworks?*

17:15

Transportation from the Ministry of Education to the Hotel Regal Pacific

Friday, May 5

9:00 – 10:00 2nd Session – Continuation of day 1 discussion

10:00 – 12:00 **3rd Session – Activity in subgroups**

Moderator: María Claudia Camacho, Chief of the Labor and Employment Section, Department of Human Development, Education and Employment of the OAS

Guiding questions for subgroups:

- *What are the main successes and lessons learned from the actions of coordination between the Ministries of Education and Labor? [Question comes from the 1st Session]*
- *What lessons learned can be synthesized to further advance in national qualifications frameworks? [Question comes from the 2nd Session]*
- *What public policy recommendations can be made to promote and improve the coordination between the Ministries of Labor and Education? What should be the priority areas for such coordination?*

- 12:00 – 13:00 **Break/Lunch and space for rapporteurs of subgroups to refine conclusions.** Lunch offered by the Ministry of Labor, Employment and Social Security of Argentina
- 13:00 – 14:00 **Presentation of subgroup conclusions**
- 14:00 – 14:30 **Closing remarks**
- Jesús Schucry Giacoman, Director of the Department of Human Development, Education and Employment of the Organization of American States (OAS)
 - Marina Larrea, National Director for International Cooperation, Ministry of Education of Argentina
 - Leonardo Julio Di Pietro Paolo, Secretary of Employment, Ministry of Labor, Employment and Social Security of Argentina
- 14:30 – 15:30 **Guided visit to the National Teachers Library and the Sarmiento Palace, focusing on architectural heritage and the works of the Art Gallery of the Ministry of Education of Argentina**
- 15:40 **Transportation from the Ministry of Education to the Hotel Regal Pacific**

ANNEX 2 – LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

ESTADOS MIEMBROS / MEMBER STATES

ANTIGUA AND BARBUDA – Ministry of Legal Affairs, Public Safety & Labour / Ministry of Education, Sports and Creative Industries

- Clare Browne, Director of Education
- Eltonia Anthony-Rojas, Labour Commissioner
- Pascal Kentish, Deputy Labour Commissioner
- Jeannette Mason, Knowledge Base Officer, Ministry of Education

ARGENTINA – Ministerio de Trabajo, Empleo y Seguridad Social (MTEySS) / Ministerio de Educación

- Ministra Raquel Cecilia Kismer de Olmos, Ministra de Trabajo, Empleo y Seguridad Social
- Andrea Fabiana García, Secretaria de Cooperación Educativa y Acciones Prioritarias, Ministerio de Educación
- Leonardo Julio Di Pietro Paolo, Secretario de Empleo, Ministerio de Trabajo, Empleo y Seguridad Social, MTEySS
- Marina Larrea, Directora Nacional de Cooperación Internacional, Ministerio de Educación
- Gerardo Alfredo Corres, Director de Asuntos Internacionales, MTEySS
- Alejandro Javier Negro, Director de Ceremonial y Relaciones Institucionales, MTEySS
- Ignacio Ballard, Dirección Nacional de Cooperación Internacional, Ministerio de Educación
- Edith Beatriz Byk, Directora Nacional de Formación Continua, MTEySS
- Carmen Concepción Lemos Ibarra, Directora de Normalización de Competencias y Certificación de Calidad, MTEySS
- Pablo Granovsky, Asesor, Dirección de Normalización de Competencias y Certificación de Calidad, MTEySS
- Sergio Fernández, Técnico en el Programa de Relaciones Multilaterales en la DNCI
- Maria Jose Olguin, Analista, Dirección de Asuntos Internacionales, MTEySS
- Thiago Sabato Martins, Analista, Dirección de Asuntos Internacionales, MTEySS
- Marisa Vaudagna, Analista, Dirección de Asuntos Internacionales, MTEySS
- Gustavo Angel Riccombeni, Asesor, Unidad Gabinete de Asesores, MTEySS
- Mariela Olivari, Analista, Dirección de Asuntos Internacionales, MTEySS
- Karen Esteve, Dirección de Normalización de Competencias y Certificación de Calidad, MTEySS
- Natalia Muffolini, Dirección de Normalización de Competencias y Certificación de Calidad, MTEySS
- Rodrigo Ardisana, Dirección de Normalización de Competencias y Certificación de Calidad, MTEySS
- Marisa Nassano, Dirección de Normalización de Competencias y Certificación de Calidad, MTEySS
- Andrea Novick, Dirección de Normalización de Competencias y Certificación de Calidad, MTEySS

- Fernando Anton, Dirección de Normalización de Competencias y Certificación de Calidad, MTEySS
- Mirna Viviana Lefosse, Dirección de Normalización de Competencias y Certificación de Calidad, MTEySS
- Silvina Seijas, Departamento de Comunicación, Dirección Nacional de cooperación Internacional, Ministerio de Educación

BAHAMAS – Ministry of Labour and Immigration

- Donnava Dorsett, Technical Assistant

BARBADOS—Ministry of Labour, Social Security and Third Sector

- Sharon Drayton, Deputy Permanent Secretary (Ag.)
- Moreen Bowen, Program Officer, People Development Implementation and Monitoring Unit
- Psyche Burke, Senior Economist

BELIZE—Ministry of Labour / Ministry of Education / Immigration Department

- Aida Reyes, Senior Labour Officer
- Emmanuel Yam, Education Officer
- Kalee Young, Education Officer
- Andrew Gill, Immigration Department

CANADA – Ministry of Employment and Social Development

- Rebecca Gowan, Deputy Director, Multilateral Labor Affairs
- LaReine Passey, Senior Policy Analyst, Multilateral Labor Affairs

CHILE – Ministerio del Trabajo y Previsión Social / Ministerio de Educación

- Catalina Estévez, Jefa del Área de Articulación con la Formación Técnico Profesional, Comisión Nacional de Certificación de Competencias Laborales (ChileValora)
- Cristian Lincovil Belmar, Secretario Ejecutivo de Educación Media Técnico Profesional, Ministerio de Educación
- Anita Melo Lagos, Profesional del Departamento de Capacitación de Personas
- Marco Antonio Castillo, Asesor, Dirección Nacional, Servicio Nacional de Capacitación y Empleo, SENSE

COLOMBIA – Ministerio de Trabajo / Ministerio de Educación

- Iván Daniel Jaramillo Jassir, Viceministro de Empleo y Pensiones, Ministerio de Trabajo
- Judy Caldas, Directora de Movilidad y Formación para el Trabajo, Ministerio de Trabajo
- Eliana Mendieta, Subdirectora de Apoyo a la Gestión de las Instituciones de Educación Superior, Ministerio de Educación
- Tatiana Cadena, Asesora de la Dirección de Movilidad y Formación para el Trabajo, Ministerio de Trabajo
- Daniela Aragón Salleg, Asesora de la Oficina de Cooperación y Relaciones Internacionales, Ministerio de Trabajo
- Gisela Suárez, Funcionaria de Marco Nacional de Cualificaciones
- Diana Mora, Funcionaria de Marco Nacional de Cualificaciones
- Néstor Suarez, Oficina de Cooperación y Asuntos Internacionales, Ministerio de Educación

COSTA RICA – Ministerio de Trabajo y Seguridad Social / Ministerio de Educación

- Juan Ricardo Wong Ruiz, Director Ejecutivo CONESUP, Ministerio de Educación
- Jenny Ramírez Peñaranda, Jefa de Departamento de Intermediación, Orientación y Prospección de Empleo, Ministerio de Trabajo y Seguridad Social

ECUADOR – Ministerio de Trabajo / Ministerio de Educación

- Darío Sebastián Zuquilanda Peralvo, Director de Competencias y Certificación, Subsecretaría de Cualificaciones Profesionales, Ministerio de Trabajo
- Cristina Ribadeneira Pontón, Directora Nacional de Bachillerato, Ministerio de Educación
- Laura Gabriela Flores Cevallos, Directora de Calificación, Reconocimiento y Certificación de Operadores, Subsecretaría de Cualificaciones Profesionales, Ministerio de Trabajo
- Carolina Granizo Núñez, Analista, Dirección Nacional de Bachillerato, Ministerio de Educación
- Fernando Naranjo, Asistente de Cooperación y Asuntos Internacionales, Ministerio de Educación
- Daniela Gallo, Funcionaria de Oficina de Relaciones Internacionales, Ministerio de Trabajo
- Laura Vásquez, Misión Permanente de Ecuador ante la OEA

EL SALVADOR—Ministerio de Trabajo y Previsión Social / Ministerio de Educación

- Gilberto Motto García, Director de Educación de Tercer Ciclo Media y Tecnológica, Ministerio de Educación
- Alison Eunice Martínez Bermúdez, Técnica Analista del Mercado Laboral, Ministerio de Trabajo
- María José Villalta Valenzuela, Técnica Especialista II de Mercado Laboral, Ministerio de Trabajo
- Daniel Villacorta Hernández, Técnico, Ministerio de Educación, Ministerio de Educación
- Marcia Miranda Aguinada, Asistente Técnico en Educación de Tercer Ciclo Media y Tecnológica, Ministerio de Educación

GRENADA—Ministry of Legal Affairs, Labour and Consumer Affairs

- Brenda Bain, Planning Officer

GUATEMALA – Ministerio de Trabajo y Previsión Social / Ministerio de Educación

- Idania Vanessa López, Jefa del Departamento de Nivel Medio, Ciclo Diversificado de la Dirección General de Currículo-DIGECUR, Ministerio de Educación
- Alejandra Aguilar Oquendo, Coordinadora de la Sección de Formación y Capacitación, Ministerio de Trabajo

GUYANA – Ministry of Labour

- Hon. Joseph Hamilton, Honorable Minister of Labour MP
- Dhaneshwar Deonarine, Chief Labour Officer

JAMAICA – Ministry of Labour and Social Security / Ministry of Education

- Dameon Black, Director, Jamaica Tertiary Education Commission
- Winsome Gordon, Chief Executive Officer-Jamaica Teaching Council
- Marcia Rowe-Amonde, Senior Director, HEART Trust/NTA- - Standards Curriculum and Learning Resources
- Lyndon Ford, Director, Electronic Labour Exchange Department, Ministry of Labor
- Steven Kerr, Director of Policy Analysis and Research, Ministry of Education
- Phylcia Marshall, Assistant Chief Education Officer, Ministry of Education
- Roy Taylor, Senior Education Officer, Industrial Education Section, Technical and Vocational Unit, Ministry of Education
- Michelle Desgouttes, Education Officer, Ministry of Education

MEXICO – Secretaría del Trabajo y Previsión Social (STPS) / Secretaría de Educación Pública (SEP)

- Donaciano Domínguez Espinosa, Director General Adjunto del Servicio Nacional de Empleo, STPS
- Brenda Georgina Lara Vázquez, Directora de Enlace con las Autoridades Educativas en las Entidades Federativas, Secretaría de Educación Pública, SEP
- Mara Angélica Salazar Monreal, Directora de Asuntos Hemisféricos, STPS
- Socorro Guadalupe Jorge Cholula, Representante Alterna, Misión Permanente de México ante la OEA
- Mariana Rodríguez, Misión Permanente de México ante la OEA

PANAMÁ – Ministerio de Educación

- Velkis de Aguilar, Supervisora Nacional de Educación

PARAGUAY – Ministerio de Trabajo, Empleo y Seguridad Social / Ministerio de Educación

- Juan Aldo Rolón Martí, Jefe de Dpto. de Investigación y Análisis Sociolaboral de la Unidad Técnica Interministerial (UTI), del Consejo Nacional de Educación y Trabajo (CNET)
- Viviana Cano Cantero, Directora General de Planificación, Ministerio de Trabajo
- Tania Quintana, Coordinadora Adjunta, Ministerio de Educación
- David Cano, Coordinador de la Unidad Técnica Interministerial, Ministerio de Educación
- Laura Molinas, Especialista Línea 2 SNCP, Ministerio de Educación
- Emilia Rotela, Técnica, Ministerio de Educación
- Laura Villalba (*cargo e institución pendiente*)

PERÚ – Ministerio de Trabajo y Promoción del Empleo (MTPE) / Ministerio de Educación

- Violeta Leyva Estela, Viceministra de Promoción del Empleo y Capacitación Laboral, MTPE
- Silvia Martínez, Jefa de la Oficina General de Cooperación y Asuntos Internacionales, Ministerio de Educación
- Giuliana Ormeño Collazos, Coordinadora de Cooperación, MTPE
- Nadiejda Quintana Vassallo, Especialista, MTPE
- Rosalía Antonio Dávila, Especialista de Cualificaciones – DISERTPA, Ministerio de Educación
- Cristina Galvez, Especialista, Oficina de Cooperación y Asuntos Internacionales, Ministerio de Educación
- Lourdes Mochizuki Tamayo, Primera Secretaria, Embajada del Perú en Argentina

REPÚBLICA DOMINICANA—Ministerio de Trabajo / Ministerio de Educación

- Esperanza Gloribel Paulino, Técnico Docente Nacional y representante del Nivel Secundario en la Modalidad Técnico Profesional, Ministerio de Educación
- Wendy Karina Moronta, Encargada de Capacitación Laboral, Ministerio de Trabajo
- Michel Rafael Pichardo, Analista, Ministerio de Trabajo

SAINT KITTS AND NEVIS – Minister of Tourism, Civil Aviation, International Transport, Employment and Labour and Urban Development / Ministry of Education

- Carla Mills-Diamond, Chief of Education Planning
- Lucinda Francis, Labour Officer IV/ Head of Employment Unit

SAINT LUCIA—Department of Labour / Ministry of Education

- Joseph Joseph, Labour Commissioner, Department of Labour
- Delthia Naitram, Education Officer – TVET, Ministry of Education

SAINT VINCENT AND THE GRENADINES — Ministry of Labour / Ministry of Education

- Nicola Sparks-Browne, Senior Education Officer
- Pearlette Primus Hannaway, Principal, Barrouallie Technical Institute
- Osborne Bowens, Dean, Division of Technical and Vocational Training
- Liz Anne Laidlow, Administrative Officer

SURINAME— Ministry of Labour, Employment and Youth Affairs / Ministry of Education, Science, and Culture

- Naomi Esajas-Frierson, Deputy Director Labor Market, Ministry of Labor
- Daniela Rosario, Deputy Director Education, Ministry of Education
- Suzanna Veveer, Deputy Director TVET, Ministry of Education

TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO – Ministry of Labour

- Rosa Mae Whittier, Director, International Affairs Unit
- Narendra Balroop, Senior Planning Officer (Ag.), Research and Planning Unit
- Kaliyma Boxill, International Affairs Officer, International Affairs Unit

UNITED STATES – Department of Labor

- Stephanie Pena, Workforce Analyst, Office of Workforce Investment, Employment and Training Administration

URUGUAY – Ministerio de Trabajo y Seguridad Social

- Daniel Eduardo Pérez Seijas, Director Nacional de Empleo

ÓRGANOS CONSULTIVOS / CONSULTATIVE BODIES

Comité Sindical de Asesoramiento Técnico (COSATE)

- Marta Pujadas, Presidenta
- Nahuel Placanica, Equipo asesor de la Presidencia del COSATE-CSA
- Vanesa Verchelli, Equipo asesor de la Presidencia del COSATE-CSA

Comisión Empresarial de Asesoramiento Técnico en Asuntos Laborales (CEATAL)

- Laura Giménez, Unión Industrial Argentina, en representación del Presidente de CEATAL
- Brian Burkett, Vice-president of CEATAL/ Counsel - Fasken LLP
- Sheena Mayers- Granville, Executive Director of the Barbados Employers' Confederation
- Armando Urtecho Lopez, Consejo Hondureño de la Empresa Privada

- Florenica Suau, Jefa de Departamento de Educación y Formación Profesional, Unión Industrial Argentina

ESTADOS OBSERVADORES / OBSERVER STATES

España

- Marcos Fraile, Consejero de Trabajo, Migraciones y Seguridad Social en Estados Unidos y Puerto Rico y ante la O.E.A.
- Elena Fernandez, Jefa de Área de Orientación Profesional y Programas Internacionales y Coordinadora Nacional EURES España

ORGANISMOS INTERNACIONALES E INVITADOS ESPECIALES / INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS AND SPECIAL GUESTS

Organización Internacional del Trabajo (OIT-CINTERFOR)

- Fernando Vargas, Especialista Senior en Formación Profesional
- Andrés Yurén, Especialista Regional de Actividades con Empleadores
- Liliana Gonzalez, Consultora

Alianza del Pacífico, Grupo Técnico Laboral

- Igor Dedic, Coordinador de la Red de expertos en certificación de competencias

Comisión Económica para América Latina y el Caribe (CEPAL)

- Andrés Espejo, Funcionario, División de Desarrollo Social
- Álvaro Ramírez, Consultor

Organización de los Estados Americanos (OEA) / Organization of American States (OAS)

- Jesús Schucry Giacomani, Director del Departamento de Desarrollo Humano, Educación y Empleo
- María Claudia Camacho, Jefa de Sección de Trabajo y Empleo
- Cecilia Martins, Especialista en Educación, Comisión Interamericana de Educación
- Azul Hidalgo, Oficial de programas, Sección de Trabajo y Empleo
- Antonella Pelizzari, Coordinadora Regional para América Latina, Alianza OEA-ProFuturo
- María Camila Salazar, Pasante de la Sección de Trabajo y Empleo